

Cambridge
103 Brattle St.
Rewritten & sent in other form.
Sept. 22.

Dear Mr. Peirce:-

Doubtless I have gone beyond measure; yet regarding your interpretation of my O-system in terms of the "respect", there is still this to say, which you may consider at your leisure or not at all, as you will.

Your interpretation^{in terms of "respects"}, as you state it, is founded on Laws I and II. The other laws are existential. What you say, if true, must apply to any system which obeys my laws I and II, whether or no the other laws are satisfied. For what you say is supposed to result from Laws I & II together, apart from the others; at least so your letter states the case.

Well, consider a system N, possessed of the following characters: It consists of any objects whatever. By an O-col.^(in N) I now propose to mean any collection of the elements

of N which ~~possess~~ is a collection infinite
in multitude. The O= collections thus defined
are subject to the following laws:—

I. If $O(\alpha)$, then $O(\delta\alpha)$, whatever collection γ maybe.

II. If, whatever element b_n of β be con-
sidered, $O(\delta b_n)$, then $O(\delta)$ (whatever col-
¹³ection β may be, whether an O=collection or not).

The first of these laws is identical with my law I.

The second includes my law II as an obvious,
although here pretty trivial case. For of course, if $O(\beta)$
is true, $O(\delta)$ is, under the conditions also true.

What are the "essential respects", in view
of which ~~the members~~ do all the members γ such
an O= collection as this agree?

Now this system N is not my

(nor are those my Q-collectors.)
system Σ_1 ; But the ^{system} others obey the first
pair of the laws of the system Σ_1 . It breaks
laws IV, V, VI. But your criticism, so far
as concerns the "respect", is not founded, as
I understand you, upon those ^{later} laws.

I conclude then, that your inter-
pretation in terms of "respects", although import-
ant as ~~a~~ a possible view of my system, is in
any case not made inevitable merely by my
Laws I and II.

Forgive me my impetuosity. I simply
want, if ever you find time for me, to have my
case in your hands. Yours truly
Josiah Royce.