

Introduction to the “Pittsburgh Loyalty Lectures” of 1909

Contained among the Josiah Royce Papers, housed at the Harvard University Archives, are three unpublished lectures on the topic of loyalty that Josiah Royce delivered at the Twentieth Century Club in Pittsburgh in February 1909. The titles of the lectures, in the sequence in which they were delivered, are: “The Conflict of Loyalties,” “The Art of Loyalty,” and “Loyalty and Individuality.” The precise location and dates of the lectures were longstanding mysteries, with conjectures of the dates of the lectures many and varied. Atop the first page of “The Conflict of Loyalty” is written, in the red pencil of archivist Edgar Franklin Wells, “1908? 1910?”¹ Royce’s student, Jacob Loewenberg dates the lectures at 1910 in his bibliography of Royce’s unpublished writings.² James Harry Cotton dates the lectures at “1910?” in *Royce on the Human Self* (and erroneously claims there to be five lectures in the series rather than three).³ In *The Loyal Physician*, Griffin Trotter dates the lectures at 1908.⁴

A 4” x 5” square of paper hidden in an archived folder of unarranged miscellany leads us to the doorstep of the venue at which Royce delivered the lectures. The following set of directions are scrawled in Royce’s hand:

Take Penn Ave. car—
Get off at 6th St.[—]walk to 5th[—]turn to right—&
go as far as the river—
Then turn to left—into
Duquesne Way the
4th house No. 428 is
Twentieth Century Club—⁵

The address, 428 Duquesne Way, was an early⁶ home to the Twentieth Century Club, established in 1894 as a women’s philanthropic and social club. In 1910, members

¹ As Patrick Dugan’s introduction to the online transcription of Royce’s “Richmond Lectures” of 1904 details, as a Ph.D. candidate in 1940, Wells was hired by the Harvard Philosophy Department to help organize the Royce papers. In a previously published writing on the Pittsburgh Loyalty Lectures, I misidentified Edgar Franklin Wells as Ronald A. Wells (the historian who published on Royce). Mathew A. Foust, “‘What Can I Do for the Cause Today Which I Never Did Before?’: Situating Josiah Royce’s Pittsburgh Lectures on Loyalty,” *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society*, Vol. 47, No. 1 (2011), pp. 87-108 (p. 87).

² Jacob Loewenberg, “A Bibliography of the Unpublished Writings of Josiah Royce,” *The Philosophical Review*, Vol. 26, No. 5 (September 1917), p. 580.

³ James Harry Cotton, “Selected Bibliography” in *Royce on the Human Self* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1954), p. 307.

⁴ Griffin Trotter, *The Loyal Physician: Roycean Ethics and the Practice of Medicine* (Nashville, TN: Vanderbilt University Press, 1997), p. 287.

⁵ Josiah Royce Papers, Harvard University Archives, HUG 1755, Box 116, Folder 15: Unarranged Notes [Accordion Folder].

purchased land at 4201 Bigelow Boulevard, where the club has remained to this day. Thus, Royce lectured to the club shortly before it established a permanent residence. In the bulletin listing a roster of the club's events for the year of 1909, we find:

Feb 1 "The Conflicts of Loyalty"

Feb 3 "The Art of Loyalty"

Feb 10 "Loyalty and Individuality"⁷

In his opening lecture, Royce refers to having been asked, "through your secretary, to tell this club"⁸ of his views concerning wisdom, duty, and problems concerning duty. The club's directory of Executive Board and Committees for 1907-1908 lists a Miss Bradley as Recording Secretary.⁹ She is also one of eight members comprising the Lecture Committee. Miss Bradley's full name was Miss Jennie D. Bradley, though she would, after nuptials, take on the moniker, Mrs. Frank M. Roessing.¹⁰ Whether Bradley personally knew Royce ahead of the invitation is unclear, however, her own writings very soon after Royce's lectures reflect theoretical sympathy, if not influence.¹¹

The "Pittsburgh Loyalty Lectures" feature refinements and additions to what Royce argues in *The Philosophy of Loyalty*, which had been published ten months prior to their delivery. Scholars may interpret these lectures as a supplement to that text, and perhaps as a honing of ideas in that text with which Royce had met criticism. The

⁶ The club rented space in downtown Pittsburgh until establishing a permanent residence. According to George T. Fleming, "its first home was on Penn avenue, later on Duquesne Way." George T. Fleming, *History of Pittsburgh and Environs*, Vol. III, eds. Special Contributors and Members of the Editorial Staff (New York and Chicago: American Historical Society, 1922), p. 608.

⁷ "Monthly Bulletin of the Twentieth Century Club," p. 28. Note that the title of the first lecture, in Royce's manuscript, is "The Conflict of Loyalties," rather than "The Conflicts of Loyalty," as found in the Twentieth Century Club bulletin. I have elected to refer to the lecture by the title found in Royce's manuscript. I thank Karen Greb of the Twentieth Century Club for locating and providing the bulletin.

⁸ Josiah Royce, "The Conflict of Loyalties" in "Pittsburgh Loyalty Lectures," Josiah Royce Papers, Harvard University Archives, HUG 1755, Box 82, p. 2.

⁹ "Membership Directory of the Twentieth Century Club," pp. 12-13.

¹⁰ For evidence that Miss Bradley is Mrs. Roessing, see her signature in *The Hand Book of the National American Woman Suffrage Association and Proceedings of the Forty-Eighth Annual Convention Held at Atlantic City, N.J., September 4-10 (inclusive), 1916*. Ed. Hannah J. Patterson. (New York City: National American Woman Suffrage Association, 1916), p. 88.

¹¹ See, for instance, the contribution of Mrs. Roessing in the "Session on Athletics for Girls" in *Proceedings of the Third Annual Playground Congress, Pittsburgh, Pa., May 11-14, 1909* (New York City: Playground Association of America, 1909), pp. 366-369. Therein, it is argued that allowing girls to participate in various forms of athletics and play awakens and cultivates "the joy of unconventionalized self-expression, independence, strength, success," while at the same time, girls should participate in "games involving the encouragement of communal energy, interdependence and that exhilaration which comes from being part of a larger and more powerful unit" (pp. 367-368). "For the complete development of girls, then," she writes, "they should have play" (p. 369). In the first of the Pittsburgh Lectures (among other places), Royce cites childhood play, and specifically team-play, as a first instance of uniting individualism and conformity in the form of loyalty. In this publication, Mrs. Roessing is listed as Vice-President of the Pittsburgh Playground Association.

lectures add substantially to our picture of Royce's philosophy of loyalty, and function as a bridge between *The Philosophy of Loyalty* and subsequent writings related to loyalty.

I will close by highlighting one aspect of each lecture, however, the reader may find useful my more detailed treatment of these lectures.¹² In "The Conflict of Loyalties," Royce lays emphasis on a term used very sparingly in *The Philosophy of Loyalty*: 'rights'. Royce goes as far as to articulate a "principle of the sanctity of private rights," stressing that loyalty harmonizes the demands of individual and social will. In "The Art of Loyalty," Royce articulates the "principle of the prior loyalty." Whereas in *The Philosophy of Loyalty*, Royce resolves stalemates between conflicting loyalties by recommending decisiveness and fidelity (i.e., *some* cause should be chosen and served, as loyal service to a cause is more loyal to loyalty than service to none), here we are presented with a criterion for choosing between causes that seem otherwise equals against the criterion of loyalty to loyalty. In "Loyalty and Individuality," we witness the beginnings of Royce's shifting in the way that he talks about the eternal consciousness of the universe in which individual experience is fragmentary. In *The Philosophy of Loyalty* (1908), the loyal individual recognizes one's own consciousness as fragmentary of the eternal world consciousness and is moved to loyal expression of the world-spirit through one's own life. In "Loyalty and Individuality" (1909), the loyal individual simply recognizes loyalty, or one's creative expression of adoration, as a project that is both spiritual and unifying. This thought paves the way to Royce's notion in "Loyalty and Insight" (1910) of loyalty to causes imparting religious insight, and Royce's description of loyalty as itself a religion in *The Sources of Religious Insight* (1912).

Mathew A. Foust
October 2015

¹² Mathew A. Foust, " 'What Can I Do for the Cause Today Which I Never Did Before?': Situating Josiah Royce's Pittsburgh Lectures on Loyalty," *Transactions of the Charles S. Peirce Society*, Vol. 47, No. 1 (2011), pp. 87-108.